

Br. Bill Grace and Peace and a Good Day to all!

Susie she/her/hers : Good morning everyone from Colorado, Blessings to you.

Eileen : Hello from Salisbury, CT.

Bonnie : lunchtime in Charleston SC

Barbara : Late afternoon in Central Scotland

Roy : From Alameda, as Marcus's editor at Harper back in the 80's, I am glad to be here. Marianne and I worked together at Harper also. So it is even more fun!

Sheila : Good morning from Milwaukee, WI.

Vicki : Hello from central Nebraska

Sandi : Good Morning from Edmonton, Alberta Canada

Kathy : Greetings from Cheney, WA

Barbara: Hello from Ontario Canada

michael : Greetings from Wethersfield, CT

Pat : Greetings from London, Ontario, Canada

Stephen C : Hello from Yorkshire UK

Jan : Good Morning from Mayne Island, BC, Canada

Harriet : Good Morning from Portland, Oregon

Meaghan : Thank you everyone! Reminder to keep yourselves muted until we call on you!
Thank you!

Sue : Good afternoon everyone from Brighton, UK

Mary Jean : Good morning from West Linn, Oregon

Bill : hello from Cincinnati Ohio!

Sandy : Good afternoon to everyone on the east coast.

carol : Good morning all from Tempe, AZ

Alexis : good afternoon from Laconia NH!

Sandy : Greetings from Indianapolis.

Jim and Susan : Hello from Palm Harbor, Florida

Peggy : good afternoon from Winston-Salem North Carolina

Kathie : And from the East Coast, hello from Cary NC

Jan : Happy Saturday from North Manchester, IN.

Edward : Greetings from Steamboat Springs CO!

Patty : Greetings from Kirkland, WA

Lorraine : Hello from Bowen Island, British Columbia..... 😊

Jim : Hello from Jim High in Mississippi

Dorothy : Greetings from Laurens in Upstate South Carolina

Norris : Hello from Newport Beach, CA

Tom & Diane : Greetings from Santa Barbara!

Patricia : Good evening from Bridge of Allan, Scotland.

Linda : Greetings from Northfield, MN. We sure enjoy these second Saturday conversations.
Thank you

barbara : Hello from Barbara Munster from Berkeley, CA

Dawn : Blessings from Portland, Oregon.

Jill (she/her) : Hello from Everett WA

Corrine & Don : Hello from Northfield, Minnesota Don and Corrine Slaughter

Áine : Hi from Sheffield UK

Harry : Hello from Tupelo MS

Donna : Greetings from Portland, OR.

Gary : Reassuring to see others eating breakfast in front of their screens. :)

Mary : Hello from Fond du Lac WI

Patricia : Hello from Sarasota, Florida!

sheila: hello from Aberdeen SD

Leigh : Good morning from Trinity Cathedral Portland OR

Robin : Good afternoon:) from central Maine.

Kate : Hi from Spokane, WA

Gary : Good morning from Vancouver (Canada).

yolanda : Hello from Bend, Oregon

Kevin : Greetings from Fort Collins, Colorado

Debbie : Hello from Cleveland, OH

shari : Hi from Newberg OR

Liz : And Good Morning from Vancouver, Washington!

Jeff : Hello from Richfield, Ohio

Norris : NYT link?

Meaghan : <https://www.nytimes.com/2021/04/04/opinion/easter-love.html>

Meaghan : Good morning everyone! We are recording the conversation this morning! And we will post it to the website later this week.

Susie she/her/hers : Does living and loving without a why and answer to competition and acquisition ?

Houston : God is the infinite silence

kateeliza : Didn't Marcus think Jesus was not the son of God

Judy : We're all sons and daughters of God, as Jesus was.

kateeliza: ok

Mary Jean : God lives His life in each of us every day...

Mary Jean : death is change, transition,

Ed : How do we incorporate Romans 3:23-25 into this non sacrificial way of thinking about Jesus' crucifixion and resurrection? " Since all have sinned and fall short of the glory of God/ they are now justified by his grace as a gift, through the redemption that is in Christ Jesus, whom God put forward as a sacrifice of atonement by his blood, effective through faith".

Judy : Paul never knew Jesus

Eileen : Ed, good question. I view that as Paul's ecstatic, profound experience of Jesus. His view. His truth. But not to be applied to everyone. Just as my experience of Jesus is not to be applied to everyone.

Mary Jean : Paul translated Jewish insights into Christian life

Alexis : Paul was Jewish. Sacrifice was the center of Temple worship , as it effected forgiveness of sin.

Suellen : Seems like the substitutionary language comes from Paul who Diana Butler Bass says was working through a revamping of the Jewish perception of Yom Kipper. What do you think of that?

Celia-chesed : WWJD? What Would John (Lewis) Do?

Susie she/her/hers : Right on

Judy : I agree

Eileen : Suellen, I think that is persuasive.

Eileen : Maybe the cross is a disclosure of a kind of defeat. Love that as something to ponder for awhile.

Celia-chesed : Paul was a Jew. Paul was a Roman. And Paul claimed to be on a par with the disciples by way of his primary ecstatic experience. So he claimed authority three ways.

Br. Bill : A suffering God.

Mary Jean : "Take up your cross..." Do what you have to in order to love one another this day...

Joan : love is stronger than death!

Celia-chesed : A sovereign god is what the American religious right claims, in order to justify capitalism, white supremacy, and continued gun violence.

Eileen : Loving his own he loved them to the end. What does that look like for any of us committed to loving to the end? Maybe not a cross, but what?

Siddika : Jesus does employ violence among the businesses and moneychanger in the Temple.

Marilyn : I don't think we were ever separated from God. Jesus was killed because he threatened pharisaic consciousness. Just my thoughts.

Susie she/her/hers : The Hero's Journey

Br. Bill : WE are the kingdom of God on the earth.

Eileen : Yes, Marilyn. Thanks.

Chela : @Siddika: was it "violence" in the temple, or rage? Was anyone personally injured, physically?

Ed : Marylyn, I agree.

Connie : We are involved! Love this. In some religions, "we are involved", too, but not in the way of love, but in the way of sacrificing our firstborns into jars that we laid at the cornerstones of our homes; of sacrificing our fellow human beings so that the skies will rain upon us!!

Virginia : I think St Augustine said, "Without God, we cannot. Without God will not." Would Jack Caputo agree?

Judy : I just don't get this God is mortal idea

Ed : Celia, yes that is very apparent.

Celia-chesed : God is mortal: God dies with every blade of grass and every fallen sparrow. But God is fully alive and keeps every blade and sparrow alive in God's compassionate, ongoing view of creation.

Connie : Gpod isn't dsoveriegn in the concept that

Siddika : Of course I wasn't in the temple with Jesus. However, he acted against the tenets of the non-violence of Gandhi and Martin Luther King.

Marilyn : Maybe think of God as created in our own image - culturally etc., and therefore God cane be threatened. But if God is an Archetype beyond all Archetypes, God is an inherent imprint in the human Psyche, and therefore immortal.

Connie : God is sovereign in the sense that God is not a dictator. It means that when we pray, things will happen. It means that we can "command" God, as it says in scripture. It means that God will listen to us.

Marilyn : God as the I Am, the Logos, Word that was before God?

Mary Jean : imprint in every cell of existence maybe

Susie she/her/hers : Caputo is saying

Susie she/her/hers : God is not sovereign but vulnerable

Celia-chesed : I definitely want to have "more life" in my (much better) body after death!

Susie she/her/hers : But we can have more life now and work to give it to others.

Br. Bill : Yes, Susie, resurrection means more life and love right here and now

Eileen : We are never talking about God, we do well to remember. We are always speaking about us, our insights, our transformations. That is not a diminishment. Marianne is offering a way for us to entertain another view of the Ultimate.

Br. Bill : That is our calling

Susie she/her/hers : yes

Marianne : Wonderful summary of the complex conceptualisation of what God is. My own perception of God is perfection within that we don't really know but can try to attain. In the way that James Martin talks about when he looks at the life of Thomas Merton - Becoming who we

are rather than who we think we ought to be. Our responsibility to make God happen within us is a wonderful suggestion!

Tom & Diane : Caputo quote from his book *Hoping Against Hope* (2015) p. 119
“The kingdom of God is what life would look like when the way we exist responds to what God insists.”

Houston Ellen : God is a devotional word for Regality - The Way Life Is!!

Janet : for awhile i did not wear a cross but now I wear it as a symbol of resistance to empire. Empire thought they had killed the dream but they reinvigorated it. It is my personal -in-your-face to abusive power.

Eileen : Cool, Janet. Thanks.

Susie she/her/hers : Well said Janet, I needed this idea as I was afraid what the cross means in today's culture. I love what you said.

Celia-chesed : When the last "press secretary" wore a cross daily to emphasize her contempt for the fourth estate, and her scorn for journalists, the cross became hostage to empire.

Ruth : Thank you. This has been the most meaningful session I have attended, yet.

Virginia : I hope that while rejecting traditional propositional faith - especially substitutional atonement - we are not also rejecting the idea that we need God's inspiration to "live another way" effectively.

Susieshe/her/hers : No, this means even more we need God's inspiration .

Marianne : I agree with you, Ruth, most wonderful insight!

Dave & Carolyn : I hear echoes of Jurgen Moltmann's *THEOLOGY OF HOPE* and *THE CRUCIFIED GOD* in today's excellent discussion.

Holly : When relationship stuff goes south, is God saying to us have hope in a better outcome being possible through forgiveness for example?

Susie she/her/hers : Did we ever know how it would turn out in the old way? I didn't

Br. Bill : Yes, Dave, Moltman's *Crucified God* was what I was thinking too. A suffering God.

Ed : Connie, I think through prayer we can realize hopefulness that God's presence and goodness will prevail in times of distress if our heart is open to a relationship with God.

JoAnna : Must go. Thank you.

Br. Bill : What we DO is our theology today.

Eileen : To Virginia: I hope that while rejecting traditional propositional faith - especially substitutional atonement - we are not also rejecting the idea that we need God's inspiration to "live another way" effectively.

I say you get to accept or reject whatever.... You don't have to reject anything!

Ed : Bill, yes!

Mary Jean : We are each responsible for manifesting God's love, existence, in our own life.

Judy : God is not mortal (subject to death) God IS, ISness cannot die.

Celia-chesed : Then each of us faces the risk of a crucifixion in which we are never held to have meaning or value.

Patty : In this way of thinking about our personal responsibility, is it true that "God is working through us?"

Jeff and Caryl : This is the world. Beautiful and terrible things will happen. Don't be afraid.
Buechner

Br. Bill : Substitutionary atonement cannot be what we base our theology on any longer.

Celia-chesed : "Do not be afraid" for me is the key message of the gospels.

Br. Bill : As Marcus taught...what difference should it make to our practice of faith if Jesus' remains were found today?

Connie : To live without a why..... to eat without a why.....We eat not for the pleasure of it, but rather, our bodies cannot function without eating. How does that apply?

Eric : If we have responsibility for God, isn't that a big "Why" to live for?

Br. Bill : Our souls cannot be free without love. How about that Connie?

Bill : Hello from Santa Cruz

Jim : Sorry but we have to leave. Thank you for a most stimulating presentation. Give us much to think and contemplate. Jim

Meaghan McCluskey : Thank you for joining, Jim!

Chela : "Living without (a) why". Perhaps that's an advantage the natural world has. (I mean, we are part of the natural world, too...) Humans are Meaning Makers, hence we press into the "why?" and "wherefore?" all the time!

Thinking also of this beautiful line from Wendell Berry's "The Peace of Wild Things":

//I come into the peace of wild things
who do not tax their lives with forethought
of grief. //

Perhaps these examples -- the rose, the wild things -- are to help us "take ourselves more lightly."

Susie she/her/hers : Totally Good News!

Dave & Carolyn : It appears that Caputo is a prolific writer. What would you suggest as a good book or two to begin reading his work?

Br. Bill : The Weakness of God and On Religion are two good starter books by Caputo

Harriet : Yes, substitutionary theory of atonement does not work for me. It feels demeaning to living beings.

Meaghan : As a reminder we will call on you to unmute yourself. If you would like to be called on, please message in the chat! Thank you!

Marianne : This concept of our responsibility for God is liberating compared to the blackmailing God of transaction. Very grateful for your presentation.

Br. Bill : I would like to be called on please.

Tom & Diane : To Dave and Carolyn: "Hoping against Hope" is a good book to start with. "On Religion 2nd edition" is another.

Joan : As I have struggled for years with the Cross/Holy Week, Easter/Resurrection, and apparently have hungered for a new theology of Christianity for the 21st Century, so thank you so much for this teaching. Would love to hear it in my church but do not, so.....love the idea of a vulnerable God (which Jesus seemed to portray) to a sovereign God.

Sandra : Is there a place for a mystic in this view

Mary Jean : Me too Joan!

Stephen : Contrating Crossans' book on Easter icons with this existential (Caputo, Tillich, Frankle) understanding.

Jackie (she/her) - PDX : This feels like Good News to me, Marianne. (Lovely to spend this time with you BTW.) It reminds me of what we discussed about process theology. That God wants us to walk with God. That God needs our help.

Marilyn : AMEN DON.

Jackie (she/her) - PDX : I'm also thinking about a Bible verse i've always struggled with: Philippians 2:6 who, although He existed in the form of God, did not regard equality with God a thing to be grasped

Connie : does that mean that if we surrender to the death that others force upon us, then God will raise us.?

Claudia : If we are made in God's image and we are mortal, doesn't that suggest that God is also mortal?

Marianne : I would imagine that the future life is what we leave behind that makes life better for those who follow us...

Marianne : Beethoven is dead but Beethoven lives.

Meaghan To Don(privately) : Thank you so much for your words Don!

Ruth To Meaghan McCluskey(privately) : Hi there, Any chance to get a transcript of today's session? Email would be fine. Many thanks

Mary Jean : We can only touch, not grasp, the Mystery.

Virginia : Don't we have to have a more inspiring message for 21st century people than "It's up to us"? I agree about "mystery".

jacob : Paradox and sacred pathways to growth... Would Jesus' message have meaning without the existence of Caesar's empire? Would the notion of a mortal God have meaning without the notion of a Sovereign God? Does the existence of death give meaning to life?

sheila : I would like to speak questions an answers

Marilyn : We have to let Jesu die, in the way we talk about him, so that we can find what 'Greater Works that we will do,' of which Jesus spoke.

Kathleen : ELCA's tag line: God's Work, Our Hand's

Kjell : A mystery is meant to be lived with awe and wonder and thankfulness for the honor to participate

Jan : Thank you for this wonderful presentation. My personal idea of the resurrection has always been that it was Jesus' message that lived on, not the physical resurrection of Jesus, the empty tomb. I always felt like the 'odd man out'

Marilyn: What IS the greater work?

Meaghan : As Jeff said we may just scratch the surface this morning, if you would like to email info@marcusjborg.org if you do not get your questions/comments answered with it, we can try to answer! Thank you

Ken : "IF" I "see" at God as I "see" gravity, and "IF" I also want to fly, I must employ human creations.

Marilyn : here

Eileen To Meaghan(privately) : How do we notify that we have a question?

Meaghan To Marilyn(privately) : I will spotlight you shortly! I am sorry!

Meaghan To Eileen(privately) : I will let Jeff know- if we do not get there please email info@marcusjborg.org and I can pass it along!

Barbara : Thank you for this inspiring session. must leave

Gary : How is the "resurrection" a new 'vision" when that "vision" was available both pre and post Jesus. in Judaism?

Chela : Obligations beckon. Also have to go!
Many thanks!

Kate : I'm off. Thank you for a thought-provoking presentation.

Meaghan : Thank you Chela and Kate for joining!

Harriet : The late Bp. Bill Spofford, bishop of the Episcopal Diocese of Eastern Oregon, taught that Jesus' death and resurrection tells us that God overcomes suffering in this. John 10:10, "I come that you may have life and have it in abundance."

Steve : Thank you for this discussion today ... living as a follower of the Way as "response" rather than "answer" seems to call me to greater attentiveness to the needs of others than I would otherwise have.

Connie : Don't understand your remark about the logos being before God. the logos WAS God, was with God.

kateeliza : What about sue monk kids book, book go longings

Mary Jean : Thank you to all. MJR

Mary : Every month you stretch my mind and my heart. Thank you!

Celia-chesed : We are an incarnational religion. The physical body matters and carries divine significance.

Connie : Amen Celia!

Stephen C : Well said Celia

janet : It sometimes helps - Romans quote - to get a greek interlinear bible and see how English has added its flavor to the words/ English has 10 times more words than Greek. We are influenced by translators..

Gary : Do you believe human beings are the only species that have to work""

Pam : Atonement = at "one' (ment) with God

Brent : Two books that have helped me recently to understand the historical context out of which new testament writers interpreted Jesus death in a sacrificial framework are: 1. Problems with Atonement by Stephen Finlan and 2. New Testament Christianity in the Roman World by Harry Maier

Gary : Sorry, do you believe that human beings are the only species that have to "work" at bringing in the Kingdom of God? Whatabout the lion lying down with the lamb?

David : the strong gap between natural and supernatural didn't arise until the 16th century. I wonder whether we are still stuck with it.

Marilyn To Meaghan(privately) : I like to think of death as like a blade of grass, or a flower that dies, and when it returns it is a flower, but not that same flower. We will be born again, but it won't be the personal Marilyn. It will be a new form and creation.

Meaghan To (privately) : Thank you for sharing Marilyn!

Tom & Diane : Other books as an introduction to Caputo are "What Would Jesus Deconstruct?" and "The Folly of God."

Harriet : My memory from Latin classes of years! ago and liturgics classes is that "sacrifice" comes from Latin "sacer facere" to make holy. Comments?

Celia-chesed To Meaghan(privately) : Meaghan, can you let us all know how to get the recording later? Thank you.

Ken : Weak theology is like gravity.

Gary : I find the word "mortal" a very poor word to use as it absolutely suggests death. The concept your getting at I agree with.

Meaghan : If you would like to rewatch this conversation, we will post the recording of today on our website www.marcusjborg.org later this next week! Usually Wednesday or Thursday!

Harold : Thank you, good discussion

Meaghan : If you did not get your question answered: please email info@marcusjborg.org and we can try to answer it! Thank you

Meaghan To Celia-chesed(privately) : Thank you!

Virginia : I agree with Gary!

Celia-chesed : Amen. Thank you, all!

Lynn : Amen , and THANK YOU!

Sue : Thank you see you next time

Pat : Thank you!

roberta : Thank you and God Bless You, Peace,,,

Lorraine : Thank you All.

Donna : How grateful for these sessions and searchings!

Peggy : Deeply grateful for song Holy Mother by Eric Clapton. So "right" for this moment.

sheila : Sheila Richards from South Dakota wants to walkabout Marcus at Ring Lake

kateeliza: did you read sue monk kids book

Meaghan : If you do want to ask a question regarding the conversation, email info@marcujborg.org and we will try to get it answered!

kateeliza : From watch hill rhode island

Harriet : Thanks, Marianne, for all the you are offering. Thanks, Jeff, for your ministering in this.

Jan : Thank you for the thought-provoking time of sharing.

Kjell : I had a similar question asked by my NT prof at Concordia who said, Kjell, what if Jesus was not the son of God? He then walked away and left me wondering. He knew how to frame the question to get me to go further into the understanding that we are living in the magnum mysterium.

Barbara : I'd like to thank Marianne for sharing Marcus

Joan : a silver lining to pandemic! and Zoom!

Marianne : The pandemic has been a big problem but has brought some wonderful experiences. True that these Zoom sessions have been great.

Jackie (she/her) - PDX : Jackie Yerby, Portland, OR. Seeking God in the 21st Century alum from the early 2000s. Marianne, you remain one of my most important teachers.

Br. Bill : Peace and All Good! See y'all next month!

Meaghan : Thank you so much Br. Bill!

sheila: this has been a super Saturday. I must go. see you in May

Meaghan : Thank you sheila!

Barb : Marcus spoke at our Lutheran church in Lynchburg, VA (here in the middle of Falwell country) to an ecumenical gathering. We have studied many of Marcus' books in our Sunday class. Many of our members credit Marcus with restoring the presence of Christ in our lives, myself included.

Lorraine : Thank you Marianne and everyone. I must go and walk the dog, sweep the floor, play music with my friends and BE with all that I heard and felt today. Thank you. Bless you all. This is so very freeing and heart opening.

Meaghan : Thank you Lorraine!

Virginia : Thank you v much for a v stimulating session.

Laura : So grateful for these

Barbara : Thank you for this time, all of this time!

Marianne : Just thank you!

Donna : Thank you to all those expressing the importance of Marianne's contributions to our lives and understanding. Ditto it all.

Jackie (she/her) - PDX : Heart open.

Marianne : Becoming who you are by James Martin Paulist Press

Jackie (she/her) - PDX : Blessings.

Meaghan : I will keep the chat open until 11:40 if you would like to leave a final note for today!